

# Paper prototyping analysis

Testing brought up the following major problems with the design:

1. The organisation of ingredients into “have” and “don’t have”
2. The purpose of the home screen
3. Switching between collection and table views is not understood or expected
4. The organisation of recipes in general

## **Organisation of ingredients**

Participants were confused by the separation of ingredients into “have” and “don’t have” sections. Tasks where they were asked specify whether they had or didn’t have an ingredient were met with confusion. The purpose of the *have/don’t have* switch at the top of the ingredients screen was also unclear to them. After testing, one participant suggested that this distinction was meaningless to them: they would decide recipes by what they wanted to use, not what they had in stock. This feature could probably be removed.

## **Purpose of the home screen**

Testing showed that the home screen may not be that useful. Participants were confused by orthogonal scrolling, preferring to tap on the “see all” button, or the “Recipes” button to reveal more recipes, rather than swiping. Participants were also unable to

recognise it as the “home screen”, or what the purpose of the home icon at the bottom of the screen was for. This feature could be removed.

## **Collection and Table views**

Participants were unable to recognise the purpose or difference between the two views. They were confused by the prompting to see more or fewer items on the screen at once, and were unsure of what the icon represented. Accidental activation of this feature might lead to confusion. This feature might not be necessary.

## **Organisation of recipes**

In discussion after the testing, one participant suggested that finding recipes by the ingredients they did or didn’t have was not that useful to them, and that it would be more useful to be able to find recipes by method or type (stir-fry, casserole, salad, etc.).

# Conclusions

## **1. Simplify the organisation of ingredients**

Organising ingredients by “have” and “don’t have” has proven to be confusing and not very useful to users. It’s better to remove it altogether, simplifying the interface.

## **2. Remove the home screen**

Users didn’t find the home screen very useful. They were confused by orthogonal scrolling, and were more likely to use the “see all” or “Recipes” button to view more items. They also weren’t sure how to return to it. Overall it doesn’t provide much value.

## **3. Remove Collection and Table view switching**

It doesn’t provide much value, and users were confused by the icon. It could also lead to confusion if activated accidentally.

## **4. Provide a way to organise recipes by method/type**

After testing it was suggested that a more useful way to organise recipes was by method or type. That is, stir-fry, casserole, salad, etc. This seems to more naturally align with how people look for recipes.

| Script  | Participant A  | Participant B  | Analysis   |
|---|--|--|--|
| <p><b># Intro</b></p> <p>This is an app for finding recipes online. You can search for recipes, or find recipes that include a particular ingredient. When you first open the app, you will see this...</p> <p style="text-align: right;">[-&gt; show home screen]</p>  |  |  |  |
| <p><b># Home screen</b></p> <p>If you would like to see more of the featured recipes, how would you?</p> <p style="text-align: right;">[expect swipe left over featured recipes]</p> <p>You like one of these featured recipes, how would you save it for future reference?</p> <p style="text-align: right;">[expect tap on "save" button]</p> <p>Where would you find that recipe in the future?</p> <p style="text-align: right;">[expect indicate saved recipes area]</p> <p>How would you find a recipe you don't see here?</p> <p style="text-align: right;">[expect tap on search]</p> <p>How would you see all your saved recipes?</p> <p style="text-align: right;">[expect tap on "see all" next to saved recipes header]</p> <p style="text-align: right;">[-&gt; show saved recipes screen]</p> | <p>Tapped "See all"</p> <p>Tapped "save"</p> <p>Indicated "saved recipes"</p> <p>Suggested tapping recipes or search</p> <p>Tapped "see all"</p> | <p>Tapped "See all"</p> <p>Tapped "save"</p> <p>Suggested search</p> <p>Suggested search</p> <p>Tapped "see all"</p> | <p>Orthogonal scrolling might not be obvious to many people</p> <p>Size of text might cause a problem</p> <p>Where saved recipes go might not be obvious. Animation might help</p> <p>Participants are accustomed to searching in apps</p> |
| <p><b># Saved recipes screen</b></p>  |  |  |  |

| Script   | Participant A                                  | Participant B                                  | Analysis   |
|--|--|--|--|
| <p>How would you fit more recipes on the screen?</p> <p>[expect tap on collection view button]</p> <p>[-&gt; show table view]</p>  | Not obvious to participant                     | Suggested tapping view switcher, or "recipes"  | The function of the view switcher icon was not obvious to participants. Participants were also confused by the request, suggesting that it's behaviour that's not really expected. |
| <p>How would you see more details about each recipe?</p> <p>[expect tap on table view button]</p> <p>[-&gt; show collection view]</p>  | Same as above                                  | Same as above                                  | Same as above  |
| <p>You don't like one of these saved recipes. How would you remove it?</p> <p>[expect tap on "unsave"]</p>   | Tapped "unsave"                                | Tapped "unsave"                                | Though not really a word, "unsave" was instantly clear to both participants  |
| <p>How would you view one of the recipes?</p> <p>[expect tap on recipe title]</p> <p>[-&gt; show recipe screen]</p>  | Tap image or title                             | Tap image or title                             | Tapping the image is expected to reveal the recipe   |
| <p><b># Recipe screen</b></p> <p>You want to email this recipe to a friend. How would you do so?</p> <p>[expect tap on share button]</p> <p>You think it would be convenient to have a print out of this recipe. How would you print it?</p> <p>[expect tap on print icon]</p> | <p>Tapped "share"</p> <p>Tapped print icon</p> | <p>Tapped "share"</p> <p>Tapped print icon</p> | <p>Purpose of share button is clear</p> <p>Purpose of print icon is clear</p>  |

| Script   | Participant A   | Participant B   | Analysis  |
|--|---|---|---|
| <p>You've tried this recipe and really like it. Is there a way you could find it quickly next time?</p> <p>[expect tap on save button]</p>   | Tapped "save"   | Tapped "save"   | Purpose of saving mechanic seems to be clear to both  |
| <p>After reading this recipe, you're not really interested. How would you return to the previous screen?</p> <p>[expect tap on recipe title]</p> <p>[-&gt; show saved recipes screen]</p>  | Tapped on recipe title                                      | Tapped on recipe title (specifically back arrow)  | Back arrow is a very important indicator here   |
| <p><b># Saved Recipes screen, again</b></p> <p>You're not sure what you want to cook, but you know what ingredients you have at home. How would you find recipes by ingredient?</p> <p>[expect tap on ingredients button]</p> <p>[-&gt; show ingredients screen]</p>   | Tapped "ingredients"  | Tapped "ingredients"  | The purpose of both the Recipes and Ingredients button at the bottom is clear   |
| <p><b># Ingredients screen</b></p> <p>According to this screen, what ingredients do you currently have?</p> <p>[expect listing ingredients on screen]</p> <p>You realise you don't actually have X. How would you remove that ingredient?</p> <p>[expect tap on "don't have" next to ingredient]</p> <p>You realise you do have some ingredients that aren't on this list. How could you find them?</p> <p>[expect tap on "don't have" at header]</p> <p>[-&gt; show list of out of stock ingredients]</p> | <p>Not clear</p> <p>Tapped "don't have"</p> <p>Not sure</p> | <p>Listed ingredients on screen</p> <p>"I'll do something else"</p> <p>Suggested search</p> | <p>Wasn't clear that this screen was supposed to have ingredients in stock</p> <p>The have/don't have organisation is unclear</p> |

| Script  | Participant A   | Participant B           | Analysis  |
|---|-----------------|-------------------------|---|
| <p>Looking at this list of ingredients, you realise that you do have some of them. What should you do?</p> <p>[expect tap on "have" next to ingredient]</p>   | Tapped "have"   | Tapped "have"           |   |
| <p>You're interested in an ingredient that you don't see here. How would you find it?</p> <p>[expect tap on "search"]</p> <p>[-&gt; show search results]</p>  | Tapped "search" | Tapped "search"         | Search is clear for both  |
| <p>You've finally found an ingredient that you're interested in. How would you see recipes that use this ingredient?</p> <p>[expect tap on ingredient]</p> <p>[-&gt; show list of recipes for ingredient]</p> | Unclear         | Tapped on ingredient    | Maybe unclear that tapping an ingredient leads to recipes for that ingredient |
| <p>You're not interested in any of these recipes. How would you return to the previous screen?</p> <p>[expect tap on ingredient title]</p> <p>[-&gt; show ingredients]</p>                                    | Unclear         | Tapped ingredient title | This request might have been confusing  |
| <p>Do you remember the screen I showed you at the start? How would you return to it?</p> <p>[expect tap on home icon]</p>   | Unclear         | Tapped "recipes"        | The purpose of the home icon is unclear                                       |

**Discussion:**

Participant A suggested that the have/not have ingredient organisation was not very useful, and unlike how they normally look for recipes. They suggested organising by method (eg. stir-fry, casserole, salad, etc.) would be far more useful to them.